

California Energy Commission
STAFF REPORT

LOCALIZED HEALTH IMPACTS REPORT

Addendum 2 for Selected Projects Awarded Funding
Through the Alternative and Renewable Fuel and
Vehicle Technology Program Under Solicitation GFO-
16-605- Innovative Service Mobility Demonstration
With Zero-Emission Vehicles

California Energy Commission
Gavin Newsom, Governor



May 2019 | CEC-600-2017-009-AD2

California Energy Commission

Jonathan Bobadilla

Primary Author

Jennifer Allen

Project Manager

Charles Smith

Office Manager

TRANSPORTATION POLICY AND ANALYSIS OFFICE

Kevin Barker

Deputy Director

FUELS AND TRANSPORTATION DIVISION

Drew Bohan

Executive Director

DISCLAIMER

Staff members of the California Energy Commission prepared this report. As such, it does not necessarily represent the views of the Energy Commission, its employees, or the State of California. The Energy Commission, the State of California, its employees, contractors and subcontractors make no warrant, express or implied, and assume no legal liability for the information in this report; nor does any party represent that the uses of this information will not infringe upon privately owned rights. This report has not been approved or disapproved by the Energy Commission nor has the Commission passed upon the accuracy or adequacy of the information in this report.

ADDENDUM 2

The Localized Health Impacts (LHI) Report for Selected Projects Awarded Funding Through the Alternative and Renewable Fuel and Vehicle Technology Program Under Solicitation GFO-16-605 (GFO-16-606) was posted on November 7, 2017 (Publication: CEC-600-2017-009).¹ This addendum uses the same approach to assess the LHI information for new project locations. The GFO-16-605 awardee, Envoy Technologies, Inc. (Envoy), is proposing adding seven additional Level 2 electric vehicle (EV) charging station locations. Project details for Envoy's proposed new project site locations, along with their environmental justice (EJ) indicators² are in Table 1 of this LHI report.

Table 1: Project Details Along With EJ Indicators

Awardee	Project Title	New Site Locations	EJ Indicator(s)
Envoy Technologies, Inc.	Sustainable Shared Mobility Project	2949 Portage Bay Davis, CA 95616	Unemployment
		880 Alvarado Drive Davis, CA 95616	Unemployment
		2501 Hurley Way Sacramento, CA 95825	Poverty
		1030 Castro Street Mountain View, CA 94040	Minority
		1355 El Camino Real Redwood City, CA 94063	Minority
		2700 Arellous Walker Drive San Francisco, CA 94124	N/A
		1460 N 4 th Street San Jose, CA 95112	Minority

Source: Energy Commission staff and Envoy Technologies, Inc.

Air Quality and EJ Indicators

Based on California Air Resources Board (CARB) air quality monitoring data,³ all seven project site locations are within nonattainment zones⁴ for either ozone, particulate matter⁵ 2.5 microns in diameter or less (PM_{2.5}), or particulate matter 10 microns in

1 Brecht, Patrick, 2017. **Localized Health Impacts Report**. California Energy Commission, Fuels and Transportation Division. Publication Number: CEC-600-2017-009.

2 EJ indicators developed by the United States Environmental Protection Agency (U.S. EPA), Office of Policy. Available at <https://www.epa.gov/ejscreen/environmental-justice-indexes-ejscreen>.

3 See: <https://www.arb.ca.gov/desig/adm/adm.htm>.

4 *Nonattainment status* (or zones) are areas designated by the California Air Resources Board with at least one violation of an air quality standard for pollutants within the last three years, as of June 2017. Available at <https://www.arb.ca.gov/desig/desig.htm>.

5 *Particulate matter* is unburned fuel particles that form smoke or soot and stick to lung tissue when inhaled. The number following "PM" represents particle size in micrometers.

diameter (PM₁₀). This indicates that there may be existing poor air quality where the project sites are located.

If a project within a nonattainment zone has more than one EJ indicator (shown in Table 1), staff will identify it as a high-risk community project location. A high-risk community project location will have the city name in red font, and the percentage values of the EJ indicator thresholds exceeded highlighted in yellow in Table 2. See Appendix A for more details on the assessment method used in this LHI report.

Table 2: EJ Indicators Compared With California

	Below Poverty Level (2017)	Black Persons (2017)	American Indian and/or Alaska Native (2017)	Asian and/or Pacific Islander (2017)	Persons of Hispanic or Latino Origin (2017)	Persons Under 5 Years of Age (2017)	Persons Over 65 Years of Age (2017)	Unemployment (March 2019)
California	11.1%	5.8%	0.7%	14.5%	38.8%	6.4%	13.2%	4.6%
EJ Indicator Threshold	>11.1%	>30%	>30%	>30%	>30%	≥26.4%	≥33.2%	>4.6%
Davis	5.7%	2.5%	0.2%	22.2%	14.2%	3.7%	10.5%	5.3%
Mountain View	4.0%	1.8%	0.3%	30.9%	18.2%	6.4%	10.7%	2.9%
Redwood City	5.9%	2.2%	0.6%	14.8%	37.0%	6.8%	12.3%	2.4%
Sacramento	15.3%	13.4%	0.7%	20.3%	28.3%	6.8%	12.2%	4.3%
San Francisco	6.4%	5.3%	0.4%	34.6%	15.3%	4.5%	14.8%	2.6%
San Jose	6.8%	3.0%	0.6%	35.2%	32.3%	6.4%	11.9%	2.9%

Sources: California Energy Commission staff, Employment Development Department, and U.S. Census Bureau.

Location Analysis and Community Impact

Since there are no locations with more than one EJ indicator (shown in Table 1), none of the new project site locations are considered high-risk community project locations. Energy Commission staff has assessed that the anticipated impact to communities where the EV charging stations will be located remains positive in terms of cleaner air and anticipated greenhouse gas reductions.

Public Comment

As provided by Title 13 CCR § 2343 of the California Code of Regulations, a 30-day public review period applies to this LHI report from the date it is posted on the Energy Commission website. The original posting date for this report is listed at <https://www.energy.ca.gov/altfuels/documents/index.html>.

The Energy Commission encourages comments by email. Please include your name or organization's name in the name of the file. Send comments in either Microsoft® Word format (.doc) or Adobe® Acrobat® format (.pdf) to FTD@energy.ca.gov.

The public can email comments to FTD@energy.ca.gov or send them to:

California Energy Commission
Fuels and Transportation Division
1516 Ninth Street, MS-44
Sacramento, CA 95814-5512

All written comments will become part of the public record and may be posted to the Internet.

News media should direct inquiries to the Media and Public Communications Office at (916) 654-4989, or by e-mail at mediaoffice@energy.ca.gov.

APPENDIX A:

Localized Health Impacts Report Method

This LHI report assesses the potential health impacts to communities from projects proposed to receive ARFVTP funding. This LHI report is prepared under the *California Code of Regulations, Title 13, Motor Vehicles, Chapter 8.1 (CCR § 2343)*:

“(6) Localized health impacts must be considered when selecting projects for funding. The funding agency must consider EJ consistent with state law and complete the following:

(A) For each fiscal year, the funding agency must publish a staff report for review and comment by the public at least 30 calendar days prior to approval of projects. The report must analyze the aggregate locations of the funded projects, analyze the impacts in communities with the most significant exposure to air contaminants or localized air contaminants, or both, including, but not limited to, communities of minority populations or low-income populations, and identify agency outreach to community groups and other affected stakeholders.

(B) Projects must be selected and approved for funding in a publicly noticed meeting.”

This LHI report is not intended to be a detailed pollution analysis of proposed projects nor is it intended to substitute for the environmental review conducted during CEQA. This LHI report includes staff’s application of the EJSM developed by the U.S. EPA to help identify projects located in areas where social vulnerability indicators, high exposure to pollution, and greater health risks are present.

High-risk community project locations are identified using data from CARB, the U.S. Census Bureau, and other public agencies. Energy Commission staff analyzes these data to assign EJ indicators for each project location specified in the LHI report. The proposed project location must meet a two-part standard as follows:

Part 1 – Environmental Standard:

- Communities located within an air quality nonattainment zone for ozone, PM 2.5, or PM 10, as designated by the California Air Resources Board for criteria pollutants.

Part 2 – Demographic Standard:

- Communities having more than one of the following EJ indicators for (1) minority, (2) poverty, (3) unemployment, and (4) age. The EJ indicator thresholds are defined by staff as:
 - 1) A minority subset represents more than 30 percent of a given city’s population.

- 2) A city's poverty level exceeds the state average poverty level.
- 3) The city (or county if city data is unavailable) unemployment rate exceeds the state average unemployment rate.
- 4) The percentage of people living in a city who are younger than 5 years of age or older than 65 years of age is 20 percent higher than the state average for persons under 5 years of age or over 65 years of age.